GE SLO 1.1 Deliberate with others and present arguments clearly, logically, and creatively.

	Initial 1	Emerging 2	Developing 3	Highly Developed 4
Deliberate with others (from Teamwork VALUE rubric)	Shares ideas but does not advance the work of the group.	Offers new suggestions to advance the work of the group.	Offers alterative solutions or courses of action that build on the ideas of others.	Helps the team move forward in deliberations by articulating the merits of alternative ideas or proposals.
Explanation of issue(s) (adapted from Critical thinking VALUE rubric)	Issue/problem to be considered critically is stated without clarification or description.	Issue(s)/problem(s) to be considered critically stated but description leaves some terms undefined, ambiguities unexplored, boundaries undetermined, and/or backgrounds unknown.	Issue(s)/problem(s) to be considered critically stated, described, and clarified so that understanding is not seriously impeded by omissions.	Issue(s)/problem(s) to be considered critically stated clearly and described comprehensively, delivering all relevant information necessary for full understanding.
Arguments (adapted from Creative Thinking VALUE rubric)	Only considers a single approach to making an argument, or reformulates a collection of existing ideas.	Considers and rejects less effective arguments. Experiments with creating a novel or unique idea, question, format, product, or synthesis.	Having selected from among alternatives, develops a logical, consistent argument. Creates a novel or unique idea, question, format, product, or synthesis.	Not only develops a logical, consistent argument, but recognizes implications and can articulate reasons for choices made. Extends a novel or unique idea, question, format, product, or synthesis to create new knowledge or knowledge that crosses boundaries.

(Updated September 2025)