**AB1460 Ethnic Studies Task Force**

**Senate Report**

**3/12/21**

**To:** Senate Chair Greg Wood, Vice Chair Jason Miller, and Secretary Jeanne Grier, APPC Chair Jared Barten, and Provost Mitch Avila

**Report Prepared by:** Jennie Luna, Chair of Ethnic Studies Task Force

**Goal of Task Force:** Implementation of AB1460

**Membership**: Raquel Baker, Geoff Buhl, Nicholas Centino, Tadashi Dozono, Beatriz Espinoza, Jeanne Grier, Maripas Jacobo, Jennie Luna, Monica Pereira, Violeta Murillo, Monica Rivas, Janet Rizzoli, Reha Kadakal

**Chair:** Jennie Luna

**Report:**

The Task force was charged with implementing AB1460 at CSUCI. At the formation of the task force, it was not yet determined if the graduation requirement would be free-standing or as a GE/Area F. We prepared for both scenarios.

Currently, Chicana/o Studies is the only Ethnic Studies program/department on our campus with a B.A. program and majors/minors. As of early Fall 2020, the Academic Senate voted to approve Africana Studies as a minor, originally housed under Political Science, but now currently resides under the History Department. The majority of the courses that constitute the minor are from other departments, all non-Ethnic Studies. It is unclear/undetermined if Africana Studies will evolve or see itself as an Ethnic Studies program, and how it will function without African American/Black Studies Faculty, but it has established an introductory course created by English Faculty, Raquel Baker, whose work/academic background is informed by African American/Black Studies and who serves on the Ethnic Studies Council at CSUCI.

Initially, we determined the seamless route would be to reconstitute the current Multicultural Perspective Requirement and transition it as an Ethnic Studies requirement. This would have allowed for broader course offerings in lower and upper division courses and would not impact unit load for any student at CI.

In preparation for both possible scenarios, we determined four GE lower division Ethnic Studies courses that would align with the core competencies/student learning outcomes provided to us as approved by the CSU Council on Ethnic Studies (CSUCES).

The goal was to begin with these four courses and build out in the following years once we knew how AB1460 would roll out in the CSU. In addition, we identified approximately a dozen upper division courses in Chicana/o Studies that also aligned with the CSUCES SLOs. With the final roll-out from the Chancellor’s office being GE-Area F and the removal of Area D units, this left us in a difficult place to figure out how this would impact students. There some majors with a high unit load, where this GE-Area F requirement would put them over the 120 unit load. We were left to figure out how to comply with both the ES legislation and the 120 unit limit policy in the CSU. First, we established which courses on our campus would be in compliance with GE-Area F to put in our catalog for Fall 2021.

These are the four courses for Fall 2021:

**Africana Studies:**

AFS 202: Introduction to Africana Studies

**Chicana/o Studies Course:**

CHS 100: Introduction to Chicana/o Studies

CHS 160: Chicana/o Cultural Expressions

CHS 200: Diversity in Latina/o Communities

These courses have been revised to fully meet the SLOs, have been submitted through curriculog and are currently in the process of final review for approval. They will be on our catalog Fall 2021. In addition, we have ensured that all 4 courses will also meet the Multicultural Perspectives (MP) graduation requirement.

As the committee worked on getting this done, we also simultaneously examined the current MP requirement, as well as possible concerns, with the Ethnic Studies requirement living in GE and how that would impact unit load and/or confuse students with having both an ES and MP graduation requirement.

**We concluded that our best recommendation would be to phase out the MP requirement and transition it to become the Ethnic Studies Graduation Requirement.**

**Arguments for this change:**

**Logistical:**

1. MP is in our mission statement; it is one of the 4 pillars, but is the only pillar with a graduation requirement. We believe it is not necessary to keep it as a graduation requirement, but can remain as a designation, as the other pillars continue to be.
2. Students will be confused having both an ES graduation requirement & MP graduation requirement
3. If MP transitions to ES, students will be afforded the ability to take upper division ES, and not be limited to lower division GE only
4. Students can double count it and it would not add more units.
5. Since students can potentially fulfill this GE at community college, having an ES graduation requirement will provide students the opportunity to take an upper division ES course home side.
6. Most disciplines that do have an “Ethnic Studies” type course embedded in their curriculum, are usually elective upper division and are not foundational nor required for the major. Therefore, they will most likely never have a course in GE-Area F, but if we have an ES Graduation Requirement on our campus, it is possible that some of these courses could be developed into cross-listed upper division Ethnic Studies courses.

**Theoretical:**

1. Making this change demonstrates our campus’ support for Ethnic Studies and Racial Justice issues that so many departments wrote letters of solidarity and commitment for over the summer. It is a good faith effort of our campus to actively work towards systemic and social change and the ongoing transformation of higher education. The foundations of education are deeply entrenched in coloniality and based in the westernized university. ES is the only discipline born of a movement and based in a pedagogy & praxis of liberation and community self-determination.
2. Opens pathways to expand our curricular offerings, by encouraging the development of more Ethnic Studies programs on our campus; it would expand intellectual rigor and opportunities to hire more Ethnic Studies faculty in the future. Encourages CI to be in line with other CSUs who have well-established comparative ES programs.
3. The views of “multiculturalism” have changed in the last 20 years; the current Multicultural Perspectives requirement may not do a sufficient job at giving students the type of education that the Ethnic Studies requirement can provide. There has been no vetting process of the current MP courses, which has created issues and student complaint. We believe Ethnic Studies can provide the type of education that the MP requirement was meant to create. Further, there is an established body of Ethnic Studies scholars on our campus and the Ethnic Studies Council of CI that can vet and be in conversation with the GE committee and the Academic Policy and Planning Committee (APPC) to ensure that the future of the ES grad requirement is consistent with the Core Competencies/SLOs.

**Potential impacts of phasing out the MP requirement:**

* Some departments will be impacted; there may be curricular and resource impacts since some courses will no longer be designated as MP graduation requirement. In addition, some departments will already be dealing with the impact of Area D units being lowered from 9 to 6 units.
* Any courses that are not Chicana/o Studies (and potentially Africana Studies), the only ES program on our campus currently, will have to go through an Ethnic Studies (ie, Chicana/o Studies) program in order to be considered for cross-listing or designated as an ES graduation requirement.

The Ethnic Studies Task Force created a plan to begin the conversation with colleagues to get a read on how faculty felt about this transition. The chair of the Task Force, Jennie Luna presented this at the November Academic Senate meeting, sent emails to all deans of the colleges and met with the Arts & Science chair’s meeting with a formal presentation, since they would be most impacted. We encouraged our faculty to attend the monthly, year-long Ethnic Studies speaker series, sponsored by Chicana/o Studies and the Ethnic Studies Council at CI. We also arranged for a speaker to present before December’s senate meeting. The speaker was asked to address the history of ES and Multiculturalism in the school of Education. We also arranged for a Faculty Brown Bag Discussion the following Thursday after senate for faculty to pose questions and concerns.

Issues that were brought up at the Faculty brown bag consisted of: Resource issues, FTEs, lack of clarity about cross-listing, wanting to develop ES courses in other disciplines, and wanting to know the difference between Multicultural and Ethnic Studies; and wanting to keep both graduation requirements. The outcome of this brown bag was that, aside from departmental resource concerns, faculty needed to hear the voices of the students to help inform their opinion and decision about changing the MP requirement to an ES requirement. At this point, although there was a student rep on the ES Task Force (unfortunately unable to attend the weekly task force meetings consistently), there had not been sufficient student input.

In the midst of this discussion, it was confirmed by the Chancellor’s office that the Ethnic Studies requirement will live in GE/Area F starting Fall 2021, which has made it even more critical to re-think how our campus needed to move forward. The removal of 3 units in Area D, means some students who have already taken 9 units of Area D may be impacted by now adding an additional requirement. High unit majors will be presented with challenges for students on our campus that are required to take both an Ethnic Studies Area F requirement and an MP requirement.

The next step was to create a forum in the Spring semester to center student voices on the issue. ES task force member Nicholas Centino then spearheaded the Ethnic Studies Town Hall meetings and brought into the conversation the Division of Student Affairs to help facilitate and encourage student participation. The town hall forums, held March 2nd & 3rd, were well attended with over 160 participants on the zoom call, the majority being students, but many faculty and upper administration were in attendance to hear the voices of students. Students in attendance overwhelmingly advocated for the ES graduation requirement over an MP requirement. Student government representatives also attended and presented a statement on behalf of ASI in favor or an ES graduation requirement. They have requested to present this statement to the next Senate meeting. All student comments from the town hall are being transcribed using Chicana/o Studies resources and will be made available to faculty who could not be in attendance.

**At this point, the original charge of the ES Task Force (to implement AB 1460 by Fall 2021) has been completed, but the work of moving ES forward on our campus is only beginning.**

**For this reason, we believe that a new task force must be reconstituted by Senate Executive Board.**

Some of the members on the current task force may not have a necessary role moving forward (such as articulation, for example). The role of the task force would be to compile questions, concerns and continue the conversation to discuss the future of the MP requirement. The task force would also need to work on developing a plan to expand Ethnic Studies and our course offerings in GE-Area F, as well as developing Ethnic Studies overall as a campus initiative.

**Moratorium on MP Graduation Requirement:**

If Senate is in agreement with the recommendation to permanently suspend the MP requirement and transition it to an ES graduation requirement, senate will need to amend the senate resolution that made MP a graduation requirement. It is too late for this to take place and make it on the 2021-2022 catalog.

**This means we will need a moratorium on the MP requirement until we can come to an agreement to make this change permanently. Some departments may want time to revamp their curriculum or courses that rely on MP**.

**The following assessment was provided by Academic Advising and Articulation to provide insight on how this will impact students:**

*In light of the Ethnic Studies Task Force providing a recommendation to replace the MP graduation requirement, demonstrating how it will negatively affect some students/academic programs with high unit counts, it is our recommendation to replace the multicultural perspectives requirement with that of an ethnic studies requirement.  In order to provide time for the campus community to have further discussions about changing the requirement and for the development of additional ethnic studies courses, a moratorium of the multicultural perspectives requirement for a minimum of two catalog years, for incoming students on catalogs 2021-2022 and 2022-2023 is recommended.*

*The following academic programs would be affected by an additional graduation requirement:*

* *Mechatronics – already at 125 units*
* *Nursing*
* *Computer Science – transfers with an AS-T Transfer Model Curriculum*
* *Global Studies - transfers with an AA-T Transfer Model Curriculum (for those that do not have their language completed prior to transfer)*
* *English – those with declared options - transfers with an AA-T Transfer Model Curriculum*

*To not negatively affect or confuse continuing students, those on catalog years 2019-2020 and prior will still be held to the multicultural perspectives requirement.* ***The Registrar’s Office would need a memorandum from either the Provost or Associate Vice Provost of Academic Programs and Planning to implement the moratorium. The second option would require a change to the By-Laws of the Academic Senate, Article 5, point 11.e. For example, a similar recommendation of consultation with individuals with expertise and a moratorium was recommended during the revision of the Graduation Writing Assessment Requirement policy*** [***SP 17-05***](https://nam10.safelinks.protection.outlook.com/?url=https%3A%2F%2Fpolicy.csuci.edu%2Fsp%2F17%2Fsp-17-005.htm&data=04%7C01%7Cjennie.luna%40csuci.edu%7Ccf3a5439b5034ef9f0db08d8a1563005%7Ce30f5bdb7f18435b84369d84aa7b96dd%7C1%7C0%7C637436738848842979%7CUnknown%7CTWFpbGZsb3d8eyJWIjoiMC4wLjAwMDAiLCJQIjoiV2luMzIiLCJBTiI6Ik1haWwiLCJXVCI6Mn0%3D%7C1000&sdata=n0P1rxlF%2BOUtxmcfXor5aOaxLJCt08t6K9jbLSB2z08%3D&reserved=0)***.***

*The following are the policies that will need to be modified to incorporate the new Ethnic Studies requirement:*

* [*SP 16-11*](https://nam10.safelinks.protection.outlook.com/?url=https%3A%2F%2Fpolicy.csuci.edu%2Fsp%2F16%2Fsp-16-011.htm&data=04%7C01%7Cjennie.luna%40csuci.edu%7Ccf3a5439b5034ef9f0db08d8a1563005%7Ce30f5bdb7f18435b84369d84aa7b96dd%7C1%7C0%7C637436738848852975%7CUnknown%7CTWFpbGZsb3d8eyJWIjoiMC4wLjAwMDAiLCJQIjoiV2luMzIiLCJBTiI6Ik1haWwiLCJXVCI6Mn0%3D%7C1000&sdata=etNHfQb9vY0lYOOJXW0m3TjEs57rMpRNtfAkEU81fI4%3D&reserved=0) *General Education Course Characteristics*
* [*SP 16-12*](https://nam10.safelinks.protection.outlook.com/?url=https%3A%2F%2Fpolicy.csuci.edu%2Fsp%2F16%2Fsp-16-012.htm&data=04%7C01%7Cjennie.luna%40csuci.edu%7Ccf3a5439b5034ef9f0db08d8a1563005%7Ce30f5bdb7f18435b84369d84aa7b96dd%7C1%7C0%7C637436738848852975%7CUnknown%7CTWFpbGZsb3d8eyJWIjoiMC4wLjAwMDAiLCJQIjoiV2luMzIiLCJBTiI6Ik1haWwiLCJXVCI6Mn0%3D%7C1000&sdata=5ZbUmamGEur9wEp1dgycgEJLguH7RQwGg3LAC%2FPGNV4%3D&reserved=0) *General Education Program Course Requirements*
* [*SP 17-07*](https://nam10.safelinks.protection.outlook.com/?url=https%3A%2F%2Fpolicy.csuci.edu%2Fsp%2F17%2Fsp-17-07.htm&data=04%7C01%7Cjennie.luna%40csuci.edu%7Ccf3a5439b5034ef9f0db08d8a1563005%7Ce30f5bdb7f18435b84369d84aa7b96dd%7C1%7C0%7C637436738848862969%7CUnknown%7CTWFpbGZsb3d8eyJWIjoiMC4wLjAwMDAiLCJQIjoiV2luMzIiLCJBTiI6Ik1haWwiLCJXVCI6Mn0%3D%7C1000&sdata=8zRl9um6JRRvpF97EzbD%2FWOh1Hp1m%2F%2FT%2FGcwMf2Jrrk%3D&reserved=0) *Multicultural Graduation Requirement*

**Other Issues & Recommendations:**

While it is understood that Ethnic Studies has been integrated into general education (Area F) and that Ethnic Studies courses will be reviewed by the General Education Committee, **it is recommended that courses be approved in consultation with the CI Ethnic Studies Council or that an Ethnic Studies representative be added to the General Education Committee.**

Overall, the fact that we only have 4 courses on our campus from which students can choose to fulfill the ES requirement (GE/Area F) is problematic. We do not see this changing anytime soon on our campus, unless there is active support from administration to establish other Ethnic Studies programs and the hiring of Ethnic Studies faculty. Since the ES graduation requirement is GE lower division, logistically CHS can’t create more than 3-4 lower division courses since students are only required to take 2 for the major; therefore GE-Area F course offerings will be slim for a long time until we have established ES programs.

We do not know the impact or taxation on Chicana/o Studies’ three faculty members and AFS 202 instructor of record who will be carrying the heavy load to implement the law by providing these bread and butter courses for the entire student population, as well as carry the added burden of educating our campus and colleagues about Ethnic Studies. In addition, they continue to work in collaboration with our Community College partners, local high school districts, and ongoing involvement at the state-wide level. More administrative support may be needed.

Although Chicana/o Studies and the ES Council of CI organized a year-long speaker series, many of our colleagues did not attend and there is still broad ignorance about Ethnic Studies as a recognized academic discipline and intellectual/scholarly tradition.

**It is recommended that the administration provide additional resources and compensation for the departments and faculty that are carrying this extra load for our campus. Further, it is recommended that professional development funds be provided for the Ethnic Studies Council to organize further workshops and curriculum development with faculty.**

There is concern and caution moving forward that some departments may desire to change the SLO’s of a course, trying to fit courses into ES, yet don’t have faculty or instructors on record with an ES tradition/training. **We recommend that departments make it a priority to hire Ethnic Studies trained faculty if they desire to incorporate ES in their major.**

**We recommend formalizing the ES council of CI.** This council was formed out of resistance to the poorly administered faculty/campus survey conducted via senate which concluded that “CI didn’t want ES.”A process needs to be established to make this council institutionalized on our campus to be at the forefront when determining the future of this discipline on our campus. This council would be critical in helping to set the parameters of how to cross list future ES courses coming from other programs as well as the vetting process. This council would be central to establishing and driving the vision of ES on our campus.

I would like to thank the Senate Executive Board for entrusting the Ethnic Studies Task Force with this important work. On a personal note, I am excited for the work ahead and am happy to meet with the board, Provost or any members of the administration if there are further questions. We hope the board and the administration will consider the task force recommendations as some of these are critical and time-sensitive. Further, it is our hope that while the work we were charged with has been completed, a new Ethnic Studies Task force will be re-constituted in some form to lead our campus in the journey ahead to establish Native American & Indigenous Studies, Asian American & Pacific Islander Studies, Africana Studies, and Comparative Ethnic Studies Departments, as well as continue to grow Chicana/o Studies.

Respectfully,

Jennie Luna

Associate Professor Chicana/o Studies

Ethnic Studies Task Force Chair

Member of the Ethnic Studies Council of CI